HOW TO TRANSLATE "THE RED HOUSE": CENSORSHIP AND THE *CLUBE DO LIVRO* DURING THE BRAZILIAN MILITARY DICTATORSHIP (1964-1985)

John Milton[*]
University of São Paulo

ABSTRACT: This study extends previous studies (Milton, 2001, 2002, 2008) made on the first ever Brazilian book club, the Clube do Livro (1942-1989). It examines the background of the censorship of the Brazilian military dictatorship (1964-1985) and gives examples of items which were cut by the Clube do Livro in its translations. It then attempts to explain how, despite rigorous censorship, the Clube do Livro managed to publish translations of two works from Romania which contained much socialist realism at the peak of the dictatorship.
KEYWORDS: Clube do Livro, Mario Graciotti, Brazilian military dictatorship (1964-1989), Book Clubs

1. Introduction

This article takes another look at and adds more information to a study I made on the translations and adaptations of the Brazilian book club, the Clube do Livro. In my 2002 book *O Clube do Livro e a tradução*, I made a detailed study of this first ever Brazilian book club, which existed from 1942 to 1989, publishing one book per month, distributed through the post to its members throughout Brazil. At its peak, during the 1960s, the Clube do Livro was hugely popular, with print runs of up to 50,000. Door-to-door canvassers enrolled members, often from homes that did not have a large number of books (indeed, after my study I was contacted by two older people who told me that as teenagers they had invested their pocket money in subscriptions to the Clube do Livro). Its publications were also distributed to schools, libraries, and army barracks through federal, state, and municipal networks. Roughly 50% of the publications were translations. The 1969 list of publications will give us an idea of the range of works published: *O misterioso caso de Ritinha*, Léo Vaz; *Frente 313*, Mário Garcia Guillén (translated from Spanish); *O diabo branco*, Leon Tolstoi (translated from Russian via French); *Trilhos de prata*, Ibiapaba Martins; *O laberinto*, V. Verpool; *Shunko*, Jorge Abalos (translated from Spanish); *O sacrifício*, Franklin Távora; *Água da esperança*, Eurico Branco Ribeiro; *Quatro irmãs*, Louisa M. Alcott (translated from English); *Nas selvas do Xingu*, Ayres Câmara Cunha; *A cabana do Pai Tomás*, Harriet B. Stowe (translated from English); and *Tempos difíceis*, Charles Dickens (translated from English).

This study will particularly look at the censorship of the Clube do Livro during the period of the long military dictatorship, from 1964 to 1985, though the toughest years were from the end of 1968 to 1976.

2. Censorship and the military dictatorship in Brazil (1964-1985)

The military dictatorship in Brazil was established in 1964, following the 31 March/1 April coup carried out by the Brazilian army, which feared that the increasingly left-wing position

[*] jmilton60@yahoo.com

of President João Goulart and his hostility to the United States could result in Brazil becoming another, much larger, Cuba. Researchers differ on exactly how much support Brazil received from the US, but it seems that the US American Military Attaché, Vernon Walters, was responsible for helping to organize a network of dissatisfied Brazilian generals. An American aircraft carrier was also stationed in the Atlantic Ocean near Rio de Janeiro in case any trouble should arise (Gaspari, 1980; Oliveira, 2019; Walters, 1978).

After the bloodless coup, the economy began to flourish and, from 1968 to 1973, grew by an average of 10% per year, reaching an amazing 14% in 1973, before the world oil crisis. This was the period of the "Brazilian miracle", with most aspects of industry, including book production, sharing similar growth rates (Hallewell, 1985, p. 480). However, according to publisher Ênio Silveira, head of the left-wing publishing house Civilização Brasileira, restrictions on what could be published meant that the area of Social Sciences was dispersed and effectively destroyed (Hallewell, 1985, p. 481).

The Minister of Education in the new government was Flávio Suplicy de Lacerda, Rector of the Universidade Federal do Paraná, who worried about obscenity to such a point he tore pages out of the works of Zola, Pérez Galdos, and Eça de Queiroz in his university library, where works by Graciliano Ramos, Jorge Amado, and Guerra Junqueira were removed (Hallewell, 1985, pp. 482-483).

The confiscation of books was disorganized and almost random. Thousands of books were confiscated from bookshops, and the main criteria for removal seem to have been: (i) they were about communism (even though they may have been against it); (ii) they were written by a persona non grata of the regime; (iii) they were translations from Russian; (iv) they had red covers; and (v) they were published by Ênio Silveira's left-wing Civilização Brasileira publishing house. We are given an idea of the inefficiency by the fact that among the books banned were *O livro vermelho da igreja perseguida* (about primitive Christian martyrs); *O caminho e a foice*, about the conflicts between Arabs and Jews; *Julião, Nordeste e revolução,* about the social problems of the Northeast of Brazil, and Portuguese novelist Eça de Queiroz' *A Capital* (Hallewell, 1985, p. 483).

In 1965 Ênio Silveira stated that there were four types of confiscated books in the Civilização Brasileira collection: firstly, those taken by mistake, as in the examples above; secondly, any book connected with Marxism, even though it may not propose any social revolution (examples include *Marxismo e alienação*, by Leandro Konder, and *Política e revolução social no Brasil*, a collection of essays on social problems in Brazil); thirdly, the works of Marx and Engels; and finally, works on the coup, such as the collection of articles previously published in newspapers *O golpe de abril*, by Edmundo Muniz (Hallewell, 1985, p. 487).

After the hardline coup within the Brazilian Military government known as the AI-5 (Ato Institucional no. 5, of 13 December 1968), which reduced civil liberties and all but closed down Congress, new laws on censorship were promulgated, such as Decree no. 1,077, in force from 6 February 1970. This extended prior censorship to books, though just those "referentes ao sexo, moralidade pública e bons costumes" (of course, "bons

costumes" is open to a much wider interpretation); in addition, Brazilian youth were supposed to be protected from any material containing "matéria erótica ou versasse sobre crime, violência, aventura amorosa, horror ou humor picante". Publishing houses were free to publish material outside these areas, but by so doing ran the risk of tough penalties if found to be breaking the law. On the other hand, a work which dealt with any of these topics could be submitted for approval, which, in addition to being almost an admission of guilt, might result in a considerable delay. This system would not require a large army of censors and would induce self-censorship among authors, translators, and editors (Hallewell, 1985, p. 494).

3. Censorship and the Clube do Livro

Siobhan Brownlie (2007) describes three kinds of censorship. The first, following Pierre Bourdieu, is a kind of structural censorship in that "the structure of the field in which the discourse circulates (…) constitutes censorship in the form of control on discourse exercised without explicit laws" (Brownlie, 2007, pp. 205-206); that is to say, those who dominate and are at the apex of this structure, with more cultural capital, are able to silence others or relegate them to subordinate or rebellious discourse. The second, public censorship, is imposed by public authorities and explicit laws, and may occur either before or after publication. Finally, the third, self-censorship, may occur either consciously or subconsciously.

The Clube do Livro, though hardly an enemy of the military regime, as will be seen, was not a major player in Brazilian society, and so had no power over dominant discourses, which were anti-communist, Catholic, and moralistic. As it ran on a strict timetable, issuing one book per month, it was hardly practical to seek official approval; far better, therefore, to adopt a form of self-censorship, initially choosing inoffensive, or classic, works, and then cutting out elements that might run foul of the censors, such as religious and sexual references. Elements that might offend readers and subscribers were also excised, as was anything considered to be stylistically complicated, such as the use of other languages, puns and word games, dialect, and poems. This resulted in standardized Portuguese that was relatively easy to read for those with limited schooling but somewhat dull and pasteurized.

4. Examples of the censorship of the Clube do Livro

The Clube do Livro took an extremely patronizing attitude to its readers. This can be seen in the Preface to *Gargantua* ([1534] 1961), which states that cuts have been made: "foram aparadas todas as incongruências e ousadas liberdades do autor, com racional adaptação do texto. Os leitores não suportariam a tradução pura e simples de muitos trechos, que fomos obrigados a eliminar, por uma questão de decência e probidade" (Machado, 1961, pp. 14-15).

Indeed, Rabelais' rollicking humour and biting satire in *Gargantua* seems something of a strange choice for the strait-laced Clube do Livro. The readers are further helped and

"protected" by the extensive use of footnotes, which clarify historical and classical references, explain apparently difficult words, and give advice on healthy living. For instance, on the first page of the Prologue to *Gargantua*, there are footnotes to give information on Alcibiades, Plato, and Harpies (Nota do "Clube do Livro" in Rabelais, [1534] 1961, p. 17). And in *Tempos difíceis*, readers are warned not to copy the habits of Mrs Sparsit: they should make sure they eat well, otherwise they might end up like the Brontë sisters and die of tuberculosis (Nota do "Clube do Livro" in Dickens, 1969, pp. 54-55). Mario Graciotti, the director and general editor, was a qualified doctor and therefore felt able to make such warnings and also stressed the dangers of alcohol, telling readers not to follow the convivial drinking habits of many of Dickens' characters: "o uso e abuso das bebidas alcoólicas são responsáveis pelas faixas patológicas que atingem a nossa saúde, principalmente nos quadros clínicos das estomatites, gastrites, colites, hepatites, polinevrites, *delirium-tremens*, alucinações, etc" (Nota do "Clube do Livro" in Dickens, 1969, p. 57).

Let us now look at some of the specific cuts made to *Gargantua*. Firstly, sexual references are removed, such as this passage in which Rabelais recommends that widows be allowed to make love two months after their husband dies:

> Moineaux lesquelles loys, les femmes vefves peuvent franchement jouer du serre cropière [make love] à tous enviz et toutes restes, deux mois après le trespas de leurs mariz. (Rabelais, [1534] 1965, p. 51).
>
> [By means whereof the honest widows may without danger play at the close buttock game with might and main, and as hard as they can, for the space of the first two months after the decease of their husbands. (Rabelais, 1653)

Similarly, references to bodily functions are excluded:

> Non obstant ces remonstrances, elle en mangea seze muiz deux bussars et six tupins. O belle matière fecale que doivoit boursouffler en elle! (Rabelais, [1534] 1965, p. 57)
>
> Notwithstanding these admonitions, she did eat sixteen quarters, two bushels, three pecks and a pipkin full. O the fair fecality wherewith she swelled, by the ingrediency of such shitten stuff! (Rabelais, 1653)

And when Gargantua's horse "pissa", this becomes the more genteel "soltou águas" (Rabelais, [1534] 1965, p. 289). The Clube do Livro also excludes Rabelais' extensive use of puns, as in the following section:

> Par mesmes raisons (si raisons les doibz nommer et non resveries) ferois je paindre un penier, denotant qu'on me faict pener; et un pot à moutarde, que c'est mon cueur à qui moult tarde; et un pot à pisser, c'est un official; et le fond de mes chausses, c'est un vaisseau de petz; et ma braguette, c'est le greffe des arrestz; et un estront de chien, c'est un tronc de ceans, où gist l'amour de mámye. (Rabelais, [1534] 1965, p. 95)

> By the same reasons (if reasons I should call them, and not ravings rather, and idle triflings about words), might I cause paint a pannier, to signify that I am in pain – a mustard-pot, that my heart tarries much for't – one pissing upwards for a bishop – the bottom of a pair of breeches for a vessel full of fart-hings – a codpiece for the office of the clerks of the sentences, decrees, or judgments, or rather, as the English bears it, for the tail of a codfish – and a dog's turd for the dainty turret wherein lies the love of my sweetheart. (Rabelais, 1653)

Needless to say, the list of synonyms for the penis is also missing:

> L'une la nommait ma petite dille, l'aultre ma pine, l'aultre ma branche de coural, l'aultre mon bondon, mon bouchon, mon vibrequin, mon possouer, ma teriere, ma pendilloche, mon rude esbat roidde et bas, mon dressouoir, ma petite andoille vermeille, ma petite couille bredouille. (Rabelais, [1534] 1965, p. 111)

> One of them would call it her little dille, her staff of love, her quillety, her faucetin, her dandilolly. Another, her peen, her jolly kyle, her bableret, her membretoon, her quickset imp: another again, her branch of coral, her female adamant, her placket-racket, her Cyprian sceptre, her jewel for ladies. (Rabelais, 1653)

The following example would be very easy to translate into Portuguese, with the use of "serviço divino". However, this section is also cut:

> "Que fera cest hyvrogne icy? Qu'on me le mene en prison. Troubler ainsi le service divin!" — "Mais (dist le moyne) le service du vin faisons tant qu'il ne soit troublé; car vous mesmes, Monsieur le Prieur, aymez boyre du meilleur." (Rabelais, [1534] 1965, p. 229)

> "What should this drunken fellow do here? let him be carried to prison for troubling the divine service. Nay, said the monk, the wine service, let us behave ourselves so that it be not troubled; for you yourself, my lord prior, love to drink of the best." (Rabelais, 1653)

Rabelais' exercises in rhyming also disappear:

> "Chiart,/ Foirart,/ Petart,/ Brenons, Chappart/ S'espart/ Sus nous./ Hordous,/ Merdous,/ Esgous,/ Le feu de sainct Antoine te ard!/ Sy tous/ Tes trous/ Esclous/ Tu ne torche avant ton depart!" (Rabelais, [1534] 1965, p. 125)

> "Shittard,/ Squirtard,/ Crackard,/ Turdous,/ Thy bung/ Hath flung/ Some dung/ On us:/ Filthard,/ Cackard,/ Stinkard,/ St. Antony's fire seize on thy toane [bone?],/ If thy/ Dirty/ Dounby/ Thou do not wipe, ere thou be gone." (Rabelais, 1653)

With the disappearance of fragments of other languages (such as the following section, in which the pompous pilgrims continue to show off and speak Latin when they escape from inside Gargantua's mouth, after nearly being swallowed by the giant), Rabelais' polyphonic text becomes a mere narrative of the more savoury episodes of Gargantua's life.

> "*Cum exurgerent homines in nos, forte vivos deglutissent nos,* quand nous feusmes mangez en salade au grain du sel; *cum irasceretur furor eorum in nos, foristan aqua absorbuisset nos*, quand il beut le grand traict (…)." (Rabelais, [1534] 1965, p. 305, emphasis in the original)

> "Quum exsurgerent homines in nos, forte vivos deglutissent nos; when we were eaten in the salad, with salt, oil, and vinegar. Quum irasceretur furor eorum in nos, forsitan aqua absorbuisset nos; when he drank the great draught (…)." (Rabelais, 1653)

Not surprisingly, Rabelais' critiques of the Church are also missing, such as the following fragment in which he suggests monks and nuns should marry each other and live together outside the monastery or convent:

> "Item, parce que ordinairement les religieux faisoient troys veuz, sçavoir est de chastité, pauvreté et obedience, fut constitu't que là honorablement on peult estre marié, que chacun feut riche et vesquist en liberté." (Rabelais, [1534] 1965, p. 403)

> "Item, for that the religious men and women did ordinarily make three vows, to wit, those of chastity, poverty, and obedience, it was therefore constituted and appointed that in this convent they might be honourably married, that they might be rich, and live at liberty." (Rabelais, 1653)

Hard times, Charles Dickens' most political novel, would seem a strange choice for the Clube do Livro to publish in December 1969, exactly one year after the issuing of the hardline AI-5. However, the Introduction plays down any political element and frames *Tempos difíceis* as a work of humanity, sensitivity and Christian feeling. Announcing that "O CULTO DA BELEZA E DO AMOR CONSAGRA CHARLES DICKENS COMO UM DOS MAIORES ESCRITORES UNIVERSAIS DE TODOS OS TEMPOS", it is framed by José Maria Machado, the translator and author of the "Nota explicativa", the introduction, as "um livro de ideias, embora não se possa denominar propriamente um livro de combate" and "um livro de tese em que se apresentam problemas básicos de superior transcendência e vão além de qualquer período de atualidade" (Machado, 1969, p. 7). For Machado, the contemporary world has managed to surpass the hardships of *Hard times*:

> A convenção universal dos Direitos da Criança e do Homem, a libertação da escravatura, o combate à agiotagem, as leis da higiene do trabalho, a organização das Nações Unidas, o sentido ecumênico da Igreja Moderna, as reivindicações trabalhistas, que, no Brasil, se realizam a partir de 1922, alimentam as nossas esperanças de que o mundo melhor se aproxima, aquele mundo sonhado pelo imortal escritor inglês. (Machado, 1969, p. 8)

This implies that those who see parallels between the poverty and juvenile crime of contemporary Brazilian cities could hardly be more wrong: we have surpassed the evils found in Dickens' work, the author insists, and must contrast our world and its institutions, rule of law, freedoms, and protections for workers with that of Dickens, rather than look for similarities.

Political references are often cut or softened. The following section, in which Dickens seems to propose a type of unionization in order to demand better working conditions, has been largely cut from the Portuguese translation:

> That every man felt his condition to be, somehow or other, worse than it might be; that every man considered it incumbent on him to join the rest, towards the making of it better, that

> every man felt his only hope to be in his allying himself to his comrades by whom he was surrounded; and that in this belief, right or wrong (unhappily wrong then), the whole of that crowd were gravely, deeply, faithfully in earnest; must have been as plain to any one who chose to see what was there, as the bare beams of roof, and the whitened brick walls. (Dickens, 1982, p. 171)

Most noticeably, the Clube do Livro translation avoids the loaded term "comrades" and stresses the error of the corrupt union official, Slackbridge: "Toda aquela multidão acreditava, com uma fé grave, profunda e sincera, na conclusão, certa ou errada (errada desta vez, infelizmente), a que [Slackbridge] chegara" (Dickens, 1969, p. 90). As for the phrase "the slaves of an iron-handed and grinding despotism" (Dickens, 1982, p. 169), which encapsulates the evils of capitalism, this becomes the milder "trabalhadores e companheiros" (Dickens, 1969, p. 90).

The concern to avoid anything that could possibly offend the censors sometimes becomes excessive. In George Eliot's *Silas Marner*, which the Clube do Livro published in 1973, Squire Cass lives in a mansion called "The Red House". How is this translated into Portuguese? As nothing less than "A Casa Amarela" ["The Yellow House"] (Eliot, 1973, p. 66). As mentioned above, red was a dangerous colour. Books with red covers were censored, and presumably the Clube do Livro wished to avoid the possibility of Squire Cass' residence being thought to be a communist bunker!

As mentioned above, non-standardized speech is all standardized. As part of my background research in *O Clube do Livro e a tradução* (Milton, 2002), I discovered that a primary norm, to use the term proposed by Toury (2003), was to standardize non-standard language in the translation of classic novels in the period studied, that of the existence of the Clube do Livro, from 1942 to 1989. This is still very much the case, as revealed by academic projects like that of Solange Carvalho, whose MA dissertation, "A tradução do socioleto literário: um estudo de *Wuthering Heights*" (Carvalho, 2007) and subsequent book, *A tradução de variantes dialetais: o caso Camilleri – desafios, estratégias e reflexões* (Carvalho, 2017), proposed translating dialects by using sub-standard elements which are common to various regions in Brazil. Stephen Blackpool's broad Lancashire dialect is translated into somewhat highbrow Portuguese:

> "I ha' coom (...) to ask yo yor advice. I need't overmuch. I were married on Eas'r Monday nineteen year sin, long and dree. She were a young lass – pretty enow – wi' good accounts of herseln. Well! She went bad – soon. Not along of me. Gonnows I were not a unkind husband to her." (Dickens, 1982, p. 110)

> "Vim (...) pedir-lhe um conselho. Do qual muito preciso. Casei-me há dezenove anos na segunda-feira de Páscoa. Ela era moça nova, bonita e ninguém tinha coisa a dizer a seu respeito. Mas bem depressa deu para o mal. Não por minha culpa. Deus sabe que não fui mau marido para ela." (Dickens 1969, p. 56)

The Professor ([1857] 1955), Charlotte Brontë's first and relatively little-known novel, is set in Brussels, where Crimsworth, from Britain, a mouthpiece for Brontë, is a teacher at

a girls' boarding school. Two main elements are censored. Firstly, anti-Catholic comments, reflecting Brontë's own strong protestant background, and secondly, comments suggesting the Flemish are second-class citizens. Obviously, the Clube do Livro was worried about offending its Catholic readers in Brazil, where Catholicism is the main religion, and also tried to water down any kind of insulting language. The following passages, which are very anti-Catholic, have been omitted:

> I know nothing of the arcana of the Roman Catholic religion, and I am not a bigot in matters of theology, but I suspect the root of this precious impurity, so obvious, so general in Popish countries, is to be found in the discipline, if not the doctrines of the church of Rome. (Brontë, [1857] 1955, p. 84)

> Sylvie was gentle in manners, intelligent in mind; she was even sincere, as far as her religion would permit her to be so (...)." (Brontë, [1857] 1955, p. 87);

> "I was no pope. I could not boast infallibility." (Brontë, [1857] 1955, p. 165)

Likewise, references to the eugenic inferiority of the Flemish have disappeared:

> (…) a band of very vulgar, inferior-looking Flamandes, including two or three examples of that deformity of person and imbecility of intellect whose frequency in the Low Countries would seem to furnish proof that the climate is such as to induce degeneracy of the human mind and body (...)." (Brontë, [1857] 1955, p. 86)

> "Flamands certainly they were, and both had the true physiognomy, where intellectual inferiority is marked in lines none can mistake; still they were men, and, in the main, honest men (...)." (Brontë, [1857] 1955, p. 58)

The Clube do Livro seems anxious to avoid any kind of racial stereotyping. After M. Pelet gets drunk and insults Crimsworth in Chapter XX, the description of Pelet as "a thorough Frenchman, the national characteristic of ferocity had not been omitted" is also left out, as are the nationalities in "French politeness, German good-will, and Swiss servility" (Brontë, [1857] 1955, p. 210).

There is a similar softening of the description of poverty to be found in Britain. The Clube do Livro version omits the sections in italics in the following passage:

> Examine the footprints of our august aristocracy; *see how they walk in blood*, *crushing hearts as they go*. Just put your head in at English cottage doors; *get a glimpse of famine crouched torpid on black hearthstones; of Disease lying bare on beds without coverlets, of Infamy wantoning viciously with Ignorance*, though indeed Luxury is her favourite paramour, and princely halls are dearer to her than thatched hovels. (Brontë, [1857] 1955, p. 208, emphasis added)

5. Two works from Romania

The zeal with which the Clube do Livro clamped down on any work even apparently remotely connected with the Soviet Union was so excessive that it was almost amusing, and we might assume that this same zeal would have been applied to works from other

countries in the Soviet bloc. However, in September 1968 and August 1970 the Clube do Livro published two works from Romania, translated by writer and journalist Nelson Vainer, a Jewish Romanian immigrant to Brazil who had also published a collection of Romanian short stories with the left-wing publishing house Civilização Brasileira, mentioned earlier. Vainer had been an official visitor to Romania in 1964, invited by the Romanian Institute for Cultural Relations with Other Countries, and again in 1966 at the invitation of the Romanian Writers' Union (Jianu, 1968, p. 6).

In order to appreciate just how curious this publication decision was, it is worth lingering a little on the contents of these two works. The 1968 work is called *O caminho do céu e outras novelas romenas* and its title story, by Nicolae Jianu (1916-1982), describes the harsh conditions in a zinc mine, where women also work. The story tells how the heroine is crushed to death by falling rock, and her lover, a fellow miner, attempts to find a way out of the mine and up to the "céu", both sky and heaven. As for the other stories in the collection, *O desconhecido* by George Calinesco (1899-1965) reflects corrupt local elections in the early years of the 20th century; *O pão* by Francisc Munteanu (1924-1993) depicts the hunger of a Romanian refugee in the Second World War in Hungary; *O girassol* by Ion Agirbiceanu (1882-1963) describes how the patience, beauty, and stoicism of young peasant woman Stana defeats her shrewish mother-in-law; *O inocente* by Tudor Arghezi (1880-1967) relates the life in prison and death of Maria Nikifor, wrongly accused of theft, and her baby son, born in prison; and finally *O idílio* by Nicolae Velea (1936-1987) narrates the tragic love affair of workers at a cooperative in contemporary Romania.

In the other work, *Um pedaço de terra* (Stanco, 1970), by Zaharia Stanco (1902-1974), the adopted daughter, Constantina, is beaten up by her husband and sent to claim her patch of land from her adoptive parents, who also beat her. The novella is full of physical violence and alcohol abuse, to the point of depicting the six-year-old neighbour Gengis as dying of an excess of plum brandy. But despite the harsh peasant realism of the story, the sun shines and there is hope for the future. Vainer's Introduction ends on a positive note, framing the novella as a very humanistic work and backgrounding the social criticism: "uma visão artística profundamente pessoal (…) mensagem firme de confiança e otimismo (…) flui um lento hálito de piedade e de amor (…) pergunta, pelas profundas razões que norteiam os não menos profundos mistérios da Vida e da Morte" (Vainer, 1970, pp. 8-9).

All the contributors to these two volumes are "official" approved writers. Stanco, or rather Stancu, was Romanian Prose Writer of 1948 for his work *Desculț* (*Barefoot*), translated into more than 30 languages, which describes the tragic life of peasants on the Danubian plain at the beginning of the 20th century. Another of his works, *Os Mastins* (1952), outlines the peasant revolt of 1907, which led to the deaths of 11,000 peasants. He was director of the National Theatre in Bucharest, the President of the Romanian Writers' Union, and a member of the Romanian Academy. Nicolae Jianu was a widely published prose writer and translator from Russian, Hungarian, and Slovak, while George Calinesco, or Călinescu,[1] was a Romanian literary critic, historian, novelist, scholar, and journalist,

[1] Available at: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/George_Călinescu (Accessed: 8 September 2020).

considered one of the most important Romanian literary critics of all time and one of the outstanding figures of Romanian literature in the 20th century. He outwardly adhered to the new Communist ideology after 1947. Francisc Munteanu was mainly a filmmaker, while Ion Agirbiceanu, or Agârbiceanu,[2] was an Austro-Hungarian-born Romanian writer, journalist, politician, theologian, and Greek-Catholic priest. Agârbiceanu spent his last decade and a half under a communist regime that outlawed his church. However, at the end of his life the government bestowed honours upon him. Tudor Arghezi,[3] a well-known poet, was initially considered as decadent by the Communist regime but later rehabilitated and awarded numerous titles and prizes, as well as celebrated as the national poet on his 80th and 85th birthdays. Nicolae Velea was a well-known author from the school of social realism.

So during the Brazilian "anos de chumbo" (the most repressive years of the dictatorship in terms of censorship and the negation of civil rights), we find that the Clube do Livro published two volumes of stories by Romanian writers highly regarded by the Communist regime, at the same time as it paid close attention to eliminating details in *Tempos difíceis* which might carry a socialist message, and even translating "The Red House" in *O tesouro de Silas Marner* as "The Yellow House". How can this apparent contradiction be explained?

As mentioned above, although works from Russia were censored, much less attention would have been paid to Soviet satellites such as Romania. Besides, in this period, Ceaușescu was following an independent foreign policy, which challenged the authority of the Soviet Union and helped him to become relatively popular in the West. For example, he refused to take part in the 1968 invasion of Czechoslovakia by Warsaw Pact forces and even actively and openly condemned the invasion. Secondly, unlike the Civilização Brasileira publishing house, the Clube do Livro would not have been a major target for censors. Thirdly, as we have seen, important framing devices were used in the Introductions, ignoring any social critique and concentrating on the humanity, optimism, and messages of hope for the future that the work may contain. A fourth reason may have to do with the political shift of the director of the Clube do Livro, Mario Graciotti (1901-1993), a doctor who moved into literature and translation in the 1930s, penning a number of volumes of short stories, novels, and travel books.[4] He set up the Clube do Livro in 1942, together with Luis L. Reid and Waldemar L. Rocha. Significantly, Graciotti was also one of the founding members of the Ação Integralista Brasileira, a party which had many things in common with Benito Mussolini's Fascists though they had no clear contact with the Nazis. Ideologically they defended private property and combatted communism; they wished to rescue Brazilian culture and were highly nationalistic; they believed in a strict moral code and

[2] Available at: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ion_Agârbiceanu (Accessed: 8 September 2020).
[3] Available at: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Tudor_Arghezi (Accessed: 8 September 2020).
[4] Among the awards he gained were the prestigious Prêmio Jabuti for Editor of the Year in 1960 and for the Essays category in 1963. In 1968 he was elected to the São Paulo Academia de Letras and worked together with José Maria Machado and Samuel Ribeiro on the *Inteligência* magazine (1935-1942), which brought together and translated news articles on current affairs from foreign sources.

authority and a hierarchical structure of society. Their symbol was the sigma, "Σ", and they used the Fascist salute and wore green shirts. At the same time, they refuted economic liberalism and the internationalization of humanity. Portugal had abandoned its colony, Brazil, and they felt that it was up to Brazilians to (re)create its greatness. The *integralismo* was admired by many of the ruling elite and middle-classers, including dictator Getúlio Vargas, initially in office from 1930 to 1945, and its emphasis on Brazilianness was taken up by a number of intellectuals who found employment in the Vargas government, such as poets Carlos Drummond de Andrade, Mário de Andrade, and Manuel Bandeira; painter Cândido Portinari; and musician Heitor Villa-Lobos.

However, in the Prefaces to the works published by the Clube do Livro we get no idea of Graciotti's Fascist sympathies. Indeed, around the time the Clube do Livro published the two works from Romania, it also published works by authors with socialist sympathies: in 1966, Émile Zola's *La Fortune des Rougnon*; in 1967, Zola's *Madame Neigeon* and Jack London's *The Call of the Wild*; in 1968, Franz Kafka's *The Great Wall of China*; in 1969, *Shunko,* Jorge Abalos' novel about Quechua-speaking Indians in Argentina, and Ayres Câmara Cunha's *Nas selvas do Xingu*, on the life of the Xingu Indians in Mato Grosso, Brazil, in addition to the already mentioned *Tempos difíceis.*

The Clube do Livro also published a novel by Jarbas Passarinho (1920-2016), *Terra encharcada* (1968), on the afflictions of regions of northern Brazil. Passarinho was one of the most important officers in the military government (1964-1985) and in the transition to democracy. His government portfolio included Minister of Labour (1967-1969), Minister of Education (1969-1974), Minister of Social Security (1983-1985), and Minister of Justice (1990-1992).

Indeed, it seems that the two Romanian works fit in to a great extent with many of the realist and regionalist works that the Clube do Livro was publishing at the time, and, with their humanistic framing, the fact they were not targeted by censorship, and the respectability of the prize-winning Mário Graciotti, it perhaps becomes less surprising that these works were published.

6. Final words: Censorship is porous

Considerable research has been done into censorship of translations in totalitarian regimes in the 20th century (for example, see Merino-Álvarez and Rabadán (2002) and Vandaele (2002) for Franco's Spain; Rundle (2000) and Fabre (2007) for Fascist Italy; Sturge (1999) for Nazi Germany). One element these studies have in common is that they show how it was not possible for the regimes to introduce blanket censorship. Despite the harshness and xenophobia of the regimes, works from enemy countries, usually popular fiction or children's works, were published even as hostilities were taking place. This was often a case of allowing the publisher which supported the government and published government propaganda to make a profit to pay for these expenses. Fabre (2007, p. 44) gives us an example from Italy:

> As late as 1941 or 1943 some publishers continued to publish works by foreign authors from unfriendly nations even in the severely regulated sector of children's literature, such as Mark Twain, E. R. Burroughs, Louise May Alcott, and Pamela L. Travers (the author of *Mary Poppins*).

An army of censors is an expensive luxury. And these censors may not always support the cause of the government they are working for. Indeed, they may let certain works through the net, especially those such as the Romanian works, which, on the surface, and from the Introduction or Preface, may seem harmless. As in Nazi Germany, Fascist Italy, and ultra-Catholic Spain, the censorship of the 1964-1985 military dictatorship was porous.

REFERENCES

Brontë, C. ([1857] 1955) *The Professor*. London: Dent.

Brownlie, S. (2007) 'Examining self-censorship: Zola's "Nana" in English Translation' in Billiani, F. (ed.) *Modes of censorship and translation: national contexts and diverse media*. Manchester: St. Jerome, pp. 205-234.

Carvalho, S. P. P. (2007) 'A tradução do socioleto literário: um estudo de "Wuthering Heights"', MA diss., Universidade de São Paulo.

Carvalho, S. P. P. (2017) *A tradução de variantes dialetais: o caso Camilleri – desafios, estratégias e reflexões*. São Paulo: Editora Transitiva.

Dickens, C. (1969) *Tempos difíceis*. Tradução de José Maria Machado. São Paulo: Clube do Livro.

Dickens, C. (1982) *Hard times*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Eliot, G. (1973) *O tesouro de Silas Marner*. Tradução de Aristides Barbosa e Henrique J. Delfim. São Paulo: Clube do Livro.

Fabre, G. (2007) 'Fascism, censorship and translation' in Billiani, F. (ed.) *Modes of censorship and translation: national contexts and diverse media*. Manchester: St. Jerome, pp. 27-59.

Gaspari, E. (1980) 'A amnésia do general', *Revista Veja*, 12 mar. 1980.

Hallewell, L. (1985) *O livro no Brasil: sua história*. São Paulo: T. A. Queiroz.

Jianu, N. (1968) *O caminho do céu*. Tradução de Nelson Vainer. São Paulo: Clube do Livro.

Machado, J. M. (1961) 'Nota explicativa – O gigante Gargântua – alta realização do espírito humano' in Rabelais, F. *O gigante Gargântua*. Tradução de José Maria Machado. São Paulo: Clube do Livro, pp. 14-15.

Machado, J. M. (1969) 'Nota explicativa – O culto da beleza e do amor consagra Charles Dickens como um dos maiores escritores universais de todos os tempos' in Dickens, C. *Tempos difíceis*. Tradução de José Maria Machado. São Paulo: Clube do Livro.

Merino-Álvarez, R. and Rabadán, R. (2002) 'Censored translations in Franco's Spain: the TRACE Project – theatre and fiction (English-Spanish)', *TTR* (*Traduction, terminologie, rédaction*), 15(2), pp. 125-152.

Milton, J. (2001) 'The translation of classic fiction for mass markets: the case of a Brazilian book club, the *Clube do Livro*', *The Translator*, 7(1), pp. 43-69.

Milton, J. (2002) *O Clube do Livro e a tradução*. Bauru: Editora da Universidade do Sagrado Coração.

Milton, J. (2008) 'Censorship in Brazil: the case of the Clube do Livro' in Seruya, T. and Moniz, M. L. (ed.) *Translation and censorship in different times and landscapes*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, pp. 199-214.

Oliveira, F. M. (2019) *Attaché extraordinaire: Vernon A. Walters and Brazil/Attaché extraordinaire: Vernon A. Walters e o Brasil*. Washington: National Intelligence College Press.

Rabelais, F. (1653) *Master Francis Rabelais: five books of the lives, heroic deeds and sayings of Gargantua and his son Pantagruel.* Translated into English by Sir Thomas Urquhart of Cromarty and Peter Antony Motteux [online]. Available at: https://www.gutenberg.org/files/1200/1200-h/1200-h.htm#link2HCH0004 (Accessed: 8 September 2020).

Rabelais, F. ([1534] 1961) *O gigante Gargântua*. Tradução de José Maria Machado. São Paulo: Clube do Livro.

Rabelais, F. ([1534] 1965) *Gargantua*. Paris: Gallimard.

Rundle, C. (2000) 'The censorship of translation in Fascist Italy', *The Translator*, 6(1), pp. 67-86.

Stanco, Z. (1970) *Um pedaço de terra*. Tradução especial de Nelson Vainer. São Paulo: Clube do Livro.

Sturge, K. (1999) 'Comment on translation in the Nazi journal *Bücherkunde*' in Vandaele, J. ed.) *Selected papers of the CETRA Research Seminars in Translation Studies 1994-1996*. Leuven: The Leuven Research Centre for Translation, Communication and Culture, pp. 117-131.

Toury, G. (2003) 'The nature and role of norms in translation' in Venuti, L. (ed.) *The Translation Studies reader*. London: Routledge, pp. 205-218.

Vainer, N. (1970) 'Nota explicativa – Encontramos o recorte de figuras humanas e a encruzilhada de vários problemas domésticos, às vezes graves e afligentes' in Stanco, Z. *Um pedaço de terra*. Tradução especial de Nelson Vainer. São Paulo: Clube do Livro, pp. 7-9.

Vandaele, J. (2002) '"Funny fictions": Francoist translation censorship of two Billy Wilder films', *The Translator*, 8(2), pp. 267-302.

Walters, V. A. (1978) *Silent missions*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday.

About the author: John Milton is Titular Professor at the Universidade de São Paulo and has helped establish the Postgraduate Program in Translation Studies. His publications include *Agents of Translation* (John Benjamins, 2009, coedited with Paul Bandia) and *Um país se faz com tradutores e traduções: a importância da tradução e da adaptação na obra de Monteiro Lobato* (Martins Fontes, 2019).